

Model Proficiency Scales for English Language Arts Priority Performance Indicators (Grades 9-12)

Purpose and Background

The purpose of this document is to provide SU/SDs with model proficiency scales to accompany the <u>English Language Arts Proficiency-Based Graduation Hierarchy</u>. This document is part of the larger <u>Vermont Framework for Proficiency</u>. The model proficiency scales were informed by extended feedback from and work with the field, including <u>Participatory Action Research</u> partnerships with Central Vermont Supervisory Union, White River Valley Supervisory Union, and Orleans Southwest Supervisory Union.

Document Overview

Each of the four Critical Proficiencies (CPs) is indicated by a separate header. Below the header for each CP (Reading, Writing, Speaking and Listening, and Language) is the text of that CP. Each CP includes three Priority Performance Indicators (PPIs) that were developed for that CP, based on the CCSS ELA Anchor Standards.

Below each CP are the proficiency scales associated with each PPI. The lefthand column of each proficiency scale includes the text for the PPI as well as parentheses that indicate which Anchor Standard(s) make up that PPI. The first set of parentheses, which contains a link to the corresponding Anchor Standard(s), lists the standard(s) that directly make up the PPI. The second set of parentheses, which includes *italicized* Anchor Standards, indicates which standard(s) could be used to support the teaching and learning of that PPI.

The first step in developing proficiency scales is determining what a student must know and do in order to demonstrate proficiency in a given PPI. This begins with unpacking the grade level standard(s) that correspond to the selected PPI. The combined learning targets identified through the unpacking process become the "proficient" level of the proficiency scale, which requires application of skills and knowledge (e.g., synthesis of information, transfer to a novel context, etc.). The "beginning" level is comprised of qualitative descriptors of the foundational skills or knowledge a student demonstrates first when working toward proficiency while the "developing" level identifies foundational skills or knowledge a student demonstrates as a steppingstone to "proficient." Finally, the "expanding" level requires creative and flexible application of skills and knowledge at an advanced level. For more information about the unpacking process, see Vermont Framework for Proficiency: Developing Proficiency Scales.

Contact: Student Pathways Division, AOE.PBLHelpdesk@vermont.gov

It is important to remember that the beginning and developing levels of the scales illustrate the learning trajectory of skills and/or knowledge expectations that build toward proficiency and do not indicate less rigor for a student. For clarity on how the language used in the scales represents depth of knowledge or differentiation of skill, refer to Hess' Cognitive Rigor Matrices for the different content areas: Reading-Listening, Writing-Speaking, Math-Science, Social Studies-Humanities, Fine Arts, Health and Physical Education, and World Languages.

A Note About Reading Scales

Two of the Reading PPIs, **Summary and Analysis** and **Craft and Structure**, include separate proficiency scales for literary text and informational text.

A Note About Writing Scales

Since the **Production** PPI contains the three text types (argument, informative/explanatory text, and narrative), there are several different ways to go about creating proficiency scales. This document shows a "general" scale that encompasses all three text types as well as a separate, more specific scale for each text type.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Textual Evidence: Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence to support conclusions drawn from the text, analysis, reflection, and/or research. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.R.1) (R.2, 3, 9) (W.9)	Use suggested close-reading strategies to determine what a text says explicitly; and Cite textual evidence that relates to an interpretation of what a text says explicitly.	Use close-reading strategies to determine what a text says explicitly; Cite textual evidence to support an interpretation of what a text says explicitly; and Use close reading strategies to draw inferences from a text.	I can: Analyze what a text says explicitly; Draw inferences from a text; and Cite strong and varied textual evidence to support an analysis of a text.	 Integrate precise textual evidence to support and enhance an analysis of what a text says explicitly and implicitly; and Make connections to other texts, self, or current world events (where applicable). or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Summary and Analysis (Literary Text): Summarize a text, including key supporting details; determine a central idea or theme; and analyze the development or interaction of individuals, events, or ideas. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.R.2-3) (R.9)	Retell the main plot points of a text; Determine a main topic and details that support its development; Discuss how characters develop and interact with others; and Discuss the setting and action sequence.	Summarize a text; Determine a central idea and describe its development; and Describe how characters develop, interact with others, and advance the plot or develop the central idea of the text.	Provide an objective summary of a text; Determine a theme and analyze its development over the course of the text; and Analyze how complex characters develop, interact with other characters, and advance the plot or develop the theme of a text.	 Provide an objective summary of multiple texts with a similar theme(s); Compare, contrast, and evaluate how a theme(s) is developed over the course of each text; Analyze the similar and different ways complex characters develop, interact with others, and advance the plot or develop the theme of each text; and Evaluate the author's choices regarding how to develop and relate elements of each text. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Summary and Analysis (Informational Text): Summarize a text, including key supporting details; determine a central idea or theme; and analyze the development or interaction of individuals, events, or ideas. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.R.2-3) (R.9)	I can: Identify the important parts of a text; Determine a main topic and details that support its development; and Identify and list a complex set of ideas or sequence of events within a text.	Summarize a text; Determine a central idea and discuss its development over the course of the text; Describe a complex set of ideas or sequence of events; and Describe how specific individuals, ideas, or events develop over the course of a text.	Provide an objective summary of a text; Analyze the development of the central idea(s) over the course of a text; and Explain how specific individuals, ideas, or events interact and develop over the course of a text.	 Provide an objective summary of multiple texts with a similar central idea(s); Compare, contrast, and evaluate how the central idea(s) of multiple texts are developed over the course of each text; Evaluate the ways each author presents an analysis or series of ideas or events; and Analyze the interaction and development of specific individuals, ideas, or events within and across texts. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Craft and Structure (Literary Text): Analyze the structure of texts, including how specific parts relate to each other and the whole; assess how point of view or purpose, including an author's potential biases, shapes the content and style of a text. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.R.5-6) (R.4)	Describe how the organization of a text contributes to its overall meaning; and Identify different points of view in texts, including a cultural experience reflected in literature.	 Describe how an author's choices about how to structure a text create specific effects; Describe a particular point of view or cultural experience reflected in a work of literature; Identify a case in which understanding a point of view requires distinguishing what is directly stated from what is really meant; and Identify an author's potential biases in a text. 	 Analyze how an author's choices about how to structure a text create effects such as mystery, tension, or surprise; Analyze a particular point of view or cultural experience reflected in a work of literature; Describe a case in which understanding a point of view requires distinguishing what is directly stated from what is really meant; and Explain how an author's potential biases shape the content and style of a text. 	Analyze how an author's choices about how to structure specific parts of a text contribute to its overall structure, meaning, and impact; and Analyze a case in which understanding a point of view requires distinguishing what is directly stated from what is really meant. - or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Craft and Structure (Informational Text): Analyze the structure of texts, including how specific parts relate to each other and the whole; assess how point of view or purpose, including an author's potential biases, shapes the content and style of a text. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.R.5-6) (R.4)	 Determine the structure of a text; Identify the author's ideas or claims; and Determine the author's point of view or purpose in a text. 	Describe the structure of a text; Describe the development of the author's ideas or claims; Describe an author's point of view or purpose in a text and identify potential biases; and Describe how an author advances their point of view or purpose.	 Analyze the structure of a text; Analyze how the author's ideas or claims are developed and refined, including the clarity of points; Explain how an author's potential biases shape the content and style of a text; and Analyze how an author advances their point of view or purpose. 	 Evaluate the effectiveness of an author's structural choices in text; Evaluate how the author's ideas or claims are developed and refined, and whether the points are clear, convincing, and engaging; and Analyze how style and content contribute to a text's power, persuasiveness, or beauty. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Production (General): Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, style, and register are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience (i.e., arguments, informative/ explanatory texts, and/or narratives). (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.W.1-4) (R.1, 3, 5) (W.5, 6, 9) (L.1, 2)	Produce writing to complete a task or communicate an idea or information. I can: Produce writing to complete a task or communicate an idea or information.	 Produce writing to communicate for a purpose; Organize information and/or ideas; Include details; Use words, phrases, and clauses to connect the major sections of the text; Establish a style and tone appropriate to purpose; and Provide a conclusion. 	 Produce writing to communicate with a specific audience for a clear purpose; Organize information and/or ideas logically; Develop ideas and/or information with relevant details; Use language and vocabulary appropriate to the purpose and audience; Establish and maintain a style and tone appropriate to the purpose and audience; and Provide a conclusion that follows from, supports, and/or reflects on the ideas and/or information presented. 	Organize writing intentionally to create a desired effect; Use intentional language, varied syntax, and/or literary devices to create a desired effect; and Provide a conclusion that creates a purpose for the audience, leaving an impact on the reader. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Production (Argument): Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, style, and register are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience (i.e., arguments, informative/explanatory texts, and/or narratives). (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CC RA.W.1-4) (R.1, 3, 5) (W.5, 6, 9) (L.1, 2)	I can: Introduce a precise claim(s); Develop the claim with reasoning; and Provide a conclusion.	 Distinguish a precise claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims; Supply evidence to develop claim(s) and counterclaims; Use words, phrases, and clauses to connect the major sections of the text; Establish a style and tone appropriate to purpose; and Provide a conclusion that summarizes the argument. 	 Establish the significance of a precise claim(s); Create an organization that logically sequences and develops claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence; Supply relevant evidence to develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly, pointing out the strengths and limitations of each; Use a variety of transitional words and phrases to create cohesion and clarify relationships; Establish and maintain a style and tone appropriate to the purpose and audience; and Provide a conclusion that follows from and supports the argument. 	 Introduce a precise, knowledgeable claim(s) in a way that connects it to a universal theme or message; Organize writing intentionally to create a desired effect; Smoothly integrate information, examples, and evidence into writing; Supply relevant and convincing evidence to develop claim(s) and counterclaims fairly and thoroughly, anticipating the audience's knowledge level, concerns, values, and possible biases; Use intentional language and syntax to create a desired effect; and Provide a conclusion that creates a purpose for the audience, leaving an impact on the reader. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Production (Informative/ Explanatory): Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, style, and register are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience (i.e., arguments, informative/ explanatory texts, and/or narratives). (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CC RA.W.1-4) (R.1, 3, 5) (W.5, 6, 9) (L.1, 2)	I can: Introduce a topic; Organize writing into paragraphs; Supply information and examples connected to the topic; and Provide a conclusion.	 Introduce a topic and details; Organize writing to make important connections and distinctions; Supply relevant information and examples to develop the topic; Use transitions to connect major sections of the text; Establish a style and tone appropriate to purpose; and Provide a conclusion that summarizes the information or explanation. 	 Introduce a topic with details and evidence; Organize writing so that each new element builds on the one before; Develop the topic thoroughly by supplying relevant and varied information and examples; Use a variety of transitional words and phrases to create cohesion and clarify relationships; Use precise language and domain-specific vocabulary to manage the complexity of the topic; Establish and maintain a style and tone appropriate to the purpose and audience; and Provide a conclusion that follows from and supports information or explanation. 	 Introduce a topic or thesis in a way that connects it to a universal theme or global message or event; Organize writing intentionally to create a desired effect; Smoothly integrate the most significant information, examples, and evidence appropriate to the audience's knowledge of the topic; Use techniques such as metaphor, simile, and analogy to manage the complexity of the topic; and Provide a conclusion that creates a purpose for the audience, leaving an impact on the reader. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Production (Narrative): Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development, organization, style, and register are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience (i.e., arguments, informative/ explanatory texts, and/or narratives). (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CC RA.W.1-4) (R.1, 3, 5) (W.5, 6, 9) (L.1, 2)	I can: Introduce the reader to one or more characters; Create a progression of experiences or events with a clear beginning, middle, and end; and Describe experiences, events, or characters.	Present a problem or situation by introducing a point of view or characters; Create a progression of experiences or events that build on one another to create a coherent whole; Use details to describe experiences, events, setting, and/or characters; and Provide a conclusion.	 Engage and orient the reader by setting out a problem, situation, or observation and its significance; establishing one or multiple point(s) of view; and introducing a narrator and/or characters; Create a smooth progression of experiences or events that build on one another to create a coherent whole with a particular tone and outcome; Use narrative techniques (such as dialogue, pacing, reflection, and/or multiple plot lines); Use precise words and phrases, telling details, and sensory language to convey a vivid picture of the experiences, events, setting, and/or characters; and Provide a conclusion that follows from and reflects on what is experienced, observed, or resolved over the course of the narrative (when applicable). 	 Engage the reader by setting out a problem, situation, or observation and/or establishing one or more unique point(s) of view (i.e., an unreliable narrator, narrators with opposing points of view, etc.); Develop dynamic and/or well-rounded characters; Use narrative techniques to enhance the development of experiences, events, and characters; Use intentional language and varied syntax and diction to add interest; and Leave an impact on the reader by connecting the narrative to a broader universal theme, addressing significant moral or social questions (when applicable). or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Writing Process: Develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or varying the approach. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.W.5) (W.1-4, 6) (L.1, 2)	I can: • Create an initial draft.	Follow a suggested planning format or template; and Improve an initial draft by making suggested revisions and edits.	Focus planning, initial drafting, and revisions on addressing what is most significant for the purpose and audience; and Strengthen writing as needed by revising, editing for conventions, rewriting, or trying a new approach.	I can: • Incorporate feedback from varied sources, resulting in a final draft that reflects a thoughtful planning, revising, editing, and rewriting process. - or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Research: Gather relevant information or evidence from multiple and diverse sources, assess the credibility and accuracy of each source (including potential for bias), and integrate the information or evidence, while avoiding plagiarism. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.W.7-9) (R.1, 6, 7, 8, 9) (W.1-6) (SL.2) (L.1, 2)	Gather information about a research topic from print and/or digital sources; Integrate information collected through research into work; and List sources.	Gather information from print and digital sources in order to answer a question or solve a problem; Integrate information and supporting evidence into work; Avoid plagiarism by paraphrasing and using quotations; and Cite sources.	 Gather relevant information from varied, authoritative sources in order to answer a self-generated research question, narrowing or broadening the inquiry when appropriate; Assess the usefulness of each source, recognizing potential for bias; Integrate information and supporting evidence into work selectively to maintain the flow of ideas; Avoid plagiarism and overreliance on any one source; and Follow a standard citation format. 	 Follow a self-guided inquiry process in order to gather the information and evidence that is most useful to task, purpose, and audience; Assess the strengths, limitations, and potential for bias of sources; Recognize the need for further research when necessary; Smoothly integrate information, examples, and evidence into work; and Connect findings to a universal theme or global message or event (when applicable). - or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Critical Proficiency: Speaking and Listening – Participate effectively in a range of discussions, collaborations, and presentations.

Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Collaboration: Prepare for and participate effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, listening to and building on others' ideas, and expressing their own clearly and persuasively while considering potential impact. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.SL.1) (R.1) (W.6, 9)	Participate in discussions or collaborations with others; Follow agreed-upon rules for discussion or collaboration; Listen to others' ideas; and Respond to direct questions and comments.	 Participate in collaborative discussions with diverse partners; Work with peers to set norms for discussion or decision-making, determine outcomes, and fulfill and assigned role; Refer to evidence when answering questions or responding to others' comments; Ask questions and make comments that are relevant to the current discussion; and Summarize key points of discussion. 	 Initiate and participate effectively in collaborative discussions with diverse partners; Work with peers to set norms for discussions and decision-making, set clear goals and deadlines, and establish individual responsibilities; Express ideas clearly while considering potential impact on others; Listen to understand, respond thoughtfully to diverse perspectives, and build on others' ideas; Refer to evidence from prior reading or research; Ask questions that relate the current discussion to broader themes or larger ideas; Actively involve others in the discussion; and Summarize key points of agreement and disagreement. 	 Facilitate collaborative discussions with diverse partners, working through conflicts as necessary; Express ideas while actively working to minimize the potential negative impact on others; Build on and reference others' ideas, making new connections when new evidence and reasoning is presented; Use evidence from prior reading or research to challenge ideas and conclusions; Ask questions that probe reasoning and evidence; Ensure all voices are heard, encouraging divergent and creative perspectives; Synthesize comments, claims, and evidence made on all sides, resolving contradictions when possible; and Determine what additional information or research is required to deepen the investigation or complete the task. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Critical Proficiency: Speaking and Listening – Participate effectively in a range of discussions, collaborations, and presentations.

Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Comprehension and Evaluation: Comprehend and evaluate information presented in diverse media and formats; evaluate a speaker's point of view, argument, reasoning, potential bias, and/or use of evidence and rhetoric. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.SL.2-3) (R.6-8) (W.8, 9)	Gather information presented in diverse media; and Identify a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and evidence.	 Gather information presented in diverse media or formats; Note similarities and differences among information presented in diverse media or formats; Describe a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence; and Identify where a speaker's point of view, reasoning, or use of evidence might be misleading. 	 Integrate multiple sources of information presented in diverse media or formats; Evaluate the credibility and accuracy of each source; and Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence, taking into account potential biases. 	 Select the best sources of informational media to inform decision-making and problemsolving; Note any discrepancies among the data of different sources; and Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric, providing feedback that would improve the presentation. - or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Critical Proficiency: Speaking and Listening – Participate effectively in a range of discussions, collaborations, and presentations.

Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Presentation: Present information, findings, and supporting evidence in such a way that the development, organization, style, register, and media are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.SL.4-6) (R.1) (W4-6, 9) (L.1)	Present information and on a topic; and Follow a suggested organizational format.	 Present information, findings, and evidence; Organize the presentation so that it fits the purpose, audience, and task; Add media for clarity or to add interest to the presentation; and Use a consistent tone. 	 Present information, findings, and supporting evidence clearly and concisely; Organize the presentation logically so that the development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and task; Make strategic use of diverse media to enhance understanding and add interest; and Adapt speech to fit the purpose, audience, and task. 	 Engage the audience with compelling presentations that seamlessly integrate information, findings, evidence, and diverse media; Convey a clear perspective while addressing alternate or opposing perspectives (where applicable); and Adapt presentations to diverse purposes and audiences while maintaining the integrity and message of the original version. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Critical Proficiency: Language – Demonstrate understanding of the conventions of English, effective language use, and breadth and depth of vocabulary.

Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Conventions: Demonstrate understanding of the conventions of English grammar and usage when writing and speaking, as well as mechanics (capitalization, punctuation, and spelling) when writing. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.L.1-2) (SL.6)	I can: • Identify examples of correct and incorrect application of the conventions of English grammar, usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling.	Demonstrate familiarity with the conventions of English grammar, usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling; and Demonstrate awareness that usage can convey specific meanings, change over time, and is sometimes contested.	Demonstrate command of the conventions of English grammar, usage, capitalization, punctuation, and spelling; and Use various types of phrases and clauses to convey specific meanings and add variety and interest to writing or presentations.	 Select the conventions for grammar and usage that are most appropriate for my task, purpose, and audience; Apply the understanding that usage is a matter of convention, can change over time, and is sometimes contested; and Resolve issues of complex or contested usage, consulting references as needed. or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Critical Proficiency: Language – Demonstrate understanding of the conventions of English, effective language use, and breadth and depth of vocabulary.

Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Knowledge of Language: Apply knowledge of language to understand how language functions differently across contexts and over time, make effective choices for meaning or style, and comprehend more fully. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CCR A.L.3, 5) (R.4)	I can: • Identify figures of speech; and • Describe word relationships.	Recognize when text follows guidelines appropriate for the discipline and writing type; Interpret figures of speech in context; Explain word relationships; and Describe nuances in word meanings.	Write and edit work so that it follows the guidelines in a style manual appropriate for the discipline and writing type; Interpret and analyze figures of speech; and Analyze nuances in the meaning of words with similar denotations.	Demonstrate understanding of the ways language functions differently in different contexts and the overall effects these differences have on meaning, style, and impact; and Analyze and evaluate the use of figurative language, word relationships, and nuances in word meanings and the impact these choices have on a reader or audience. - or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.



Critical Proficiency: Language – Demonstrate understanding of the conventions of English, effective language use, and breadth and depth of vocabulary.

Priority Performance Indicator	Beginning	Developing	Proficient	Expanding
Vocabulary: Acquire and use accurately a range of general academic and domain-specific words and phrases sufficient for communicating at the college and career readiness level. (CCSS.ELA.Literacy.CC RA.L.4, 6) (R.4) (L.5)	Use general academic and domain-specific vocabulary that has been explicitly taught; and Use reference materials to find the meanings of unknown words and phrases.	 Use general academic and domain-specific vocabulary; Gather vocabulary knowledge when indicated that it is important to comprehension or expression; Use suggested strategies to determine, clarify, or verify the meanings of unknown words and phrases; Identify patterns of word changes that indicate different meanings or parts of speech (e.g., analyze, analysis, analytical); and Consult reference materials to find the pronunciation of a word or determine or clarify its precise meaning, part of speech, or etymology. 	 Accurately use general academic and domain-specific vocabulary at the college and career readiness level; Demonstrate independence in gathering vocabulary knowledge when considering it important to comprehension or expression; Choose from a range of strategies to determine or clarify the meanings of unknown and multiplemeaning words and phrases (context clues, patterns of word changes that indicate different meanings or parts of speech, etc.); and Verify the preliminary determination of the meaning of a word or phrase. 	Skillfully use a wide range of general academic and domain-specific vocabulary; Independently choose the most effective strategy for expanding vocabulary knowledge; and Use acquired knowledge to select the best word or phrase for expression. - or - I can create alternative evidence that expands upon proficient.

